

Supplementary Information

## Social Impacts of GM Crops in Agriculture: A Systematic Literature Review. *Sustainability* 2015, 7, 8598-8620

Klara Fischer <sup>1,\*</sup>, Elisabeth Ekener-Petersen <sup>2</sup>, Lotta Rydhmer <sup>3</sup> and Karin Edvardsson Björnberg <sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Urban and Rural Development, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, P.O. Box 7012, SE-750 07 Uppsala, Sweden

<sup>2</sup> Department of Environmental Strategies Research, KTH–Royal Institute of Technology, Drottning Kristinas vag 30 III, SE-100 44 Stockholm, Sweden; E-Mail: elisabeth.ekener.petersen@abe.kth.se

<sup>3</sup> Department of Animal Breeding and Genetics, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, P.O. Box 7023, SE-75007 Uppsala, Sweden; E-Mail: Lotta.rydhmer@slu.se

<sup>4</sup> KTH Royal Institute of Technology, Division of Philosophy, Brinellvagen 32, SE-100 44 Stockholm, Sweden; E-Mail: karine@kth.se

\* Author to whom correspondence should be addressed; E-Mail: klara.fischer@slu.se; Tel.: +46-18-67-17-71.

---

### List of the 99 Peer Reviewed Articles Reviewed

1. Acosta Reveles, I.L. The limits and contradictions of agricultural technology in Latin America: Lessons from Mexico and Argentina. *Perspect. Glob. Dev. Technol.* **2012**, *11*, 386–400, doi:10.1163/156914912X651550.
2. Ahsan, R.; Altaf, Z. Development, adoption and performance of Bt cotton in Pakistan: A review. *Pak. J. Agric. Res.* **2009**, *22*, 73–85.
3. Ali, A.; Abdulai, A. The adoption of genetically modified cotton and poverty reduction in Pakistan. *J. Agric. Econ.* **2010**, *61*, 175–192, doi:10.1111/j.1477-9552.2009.00227.x.
4. Andrée, P. Civil society and the political economy of gmo failures in canada: A neo-gramscian analysis. *Environ. Polit.* **2011**, *20*, 173–191, doi:10.1080/09644016.2011.551023.
5. Arza, V.; Goldberg, L.; Vázquez, C. Argentina: Dissemination of genetically modified cotton and its impact on the profitability of small-scale farmers in the Chaco province. Available online: <http://repositorio.cepal.org/handle/11362/11596> (accessed on 30 June 2015).
6. Azadi, H.; Ho, P. Genetically modified and organic crops in developing countries: A review of options for food security. *Biotechnol. Adv.* **2010**, *28*, 160–168, doi:10.1016/j.biotechadv.2009.11.003.

7. Azadi, H.; Talsma, N.; Ho, P.; Zarafshani, K. GM crops in Ethiopia: A realistic way to increase agricultural performance? *Trends Biotechnol.* **2011**, *29*, 6–8, doi:10.1016/j.tibtech.2010.10.002.
8. Bazuin, S.; Azadi, H.; Witlox, F. Application of GM crops in Sub-Saharan Africa: Lessons learned from Green Revolution. *Biotechnol. Adv.* **2011**, *29*, 908–912, doi:10.1016/j.biotechadv.2011.07.011.
9. Bellon, M.R.; Berthaud, J. Traditional Mexican agricultural systems and the potential impacts of transgenic varieties on maize diversity. *Agric. Hum. Values* **2006**, *23*, 3–14, doi:10.1007/s10460-004-5861-z.
10. Bennett, R.; Ismael, Y.; Morse, S.; Shankar, B. Reductions in insecticide use from adoption of Bt cotton in South Africa: Impacts on economic performance and toxic load to the environment. *J. Agric. Sci.* **2004**, *142*, 665–674, doi:10.1017/s0021859605004892.
11. Bennett, R.; Morse, S.; Ismael, Y. The economic impact of genetically modified cotton on South African smallholders: Yield, profit and health effects. *J. Dev. Stud.* **2006**, *42*, 662–677, doi:10.1080/00220380600682215.
12. Berman, J.; Zhu, C.F.; Perez-Massot, E.; Arjo, G.; Zorrilla-Lopez, U.; Masip, G.; Banakar, R.; Sanahuja, G.; Farré, G.; Miralpeix, B.; *et al.* Can the world afford to ignore biotechnology solutions that address food insecurity? *Plant Mol. Biol.* **2013**, *83*, 5–19, doi:10.1007/s11103-013-0027-2.
13. Bhardwaj, A. Genetically modified crops and sustainability of farm livelihoods: A comparative analysis of India, China and Brazil. *Asian Biotechnol. Dev. Rev.* **2013**, *15*, 31–59.
14. Bothma, G.; Mashaba, C.; Mkhonza, N.; Chakauya, E.; Chikwamba, R. GMOs in Africa: Opportunities and challenges in South Africa. *GM Crops* **2010**, *1*, 175–180, doi:10.4161/gmcr.1.4.13533.
15. Botta, G.F.; Tolon-Becerra, A.; Lastra-Bravo, X.; Tourn, M.C. A research of the environmental and social effects of the adoption of biotechnological practices for soybean cultivation in Argentina. *Am. J. Plant Sci.* **2011**, *2*, 359–369, doi:10.4236/ajps.2011.23041.
16. Brookes, G.; Barfoot, P. Global impact of biotech crops: Socio-economic and environmental effects in the first ten years of commercial use. *AgBioForum* **2006**, *9*, 139–151.
17. Brookes, G.; Barfoot, P. Global impact of biotech crops: Socio-economic and environmental effects, 1996–2006. *AgBioForum* **2008**, *11*, 21–38.
18. Brookes, G.; Barfoot, P. Global impact of biotech crops: Socio-economic & environmental effects 1996–2007. *Outlooks Pest Manag.* **2009**, *20*, 258–264, doi:10.1564/20dec06.
19. Buiatti, M. Biologies, agricultures, biotechnologies. *Tailoring Biotechnol.* **2005**, *1*, 9–30.
20. Carpenter, J.E. The socio-economic impacts of currently commercialised genetically engineered crops. *Int. J. Biotechnol.* **2013**, *12*, 249–268.
21. Chaturvedi, S.; Srinivas, K.R.; Joseph, R.K.; Singh, P. Approval of GM crops: Socio-economic considerations in developing countries. *Econ. Polit. Wkly.* **2012**, *47*, 53–61.
22. Debyani, M.R.; Neeta, S. GM crops in India with reference to Bt cotton: Opportunities and challenges. *J. Environ. Res. Dev.* **2012**, *7*, 188–193.
23. Dowd-Uribe, B. Engineering yields and inequality? How institutions and agro-ecology shape Bt cotton outcomes in Burkina Faso. *Geoforum* **2014**, *53*, 161–171, doi:10.1016/j.geoforum.2013.02.010.
24. Ervin, D.E.; Glenna, L.L.; Jussaume, R.A., Jr. Are biotechnology and sustainable agriculture compatible? *Renew. Agric. Food Syst.* **2010**, *25*, 143–157, doi:10.1017/S1742170510000189.
25. Ervin, D.E.; Glenna, L.L.; Jussaume, R.A., Jr. The theory and practice of genetically engineered crops and agricultural sustainability. *Sustainability* **2011**, *3*, 847–874, doi:10.3390/su3060847.

26. Ezezika, O.C.; Deadman, J.; Daar, A.S. She came, she saw, she sowed: Re-negotiating gender-responsive priorities for effective development of agricultural biotechnology in sub-Saharan Africa. *J. Agric. Environ. Ethics* **2013**, *26*, 461–471, doi:10.1007/s10806-012-9396-9.
27. Finger, R.; El Benni, N.; Kaphengst, T.; Evans, C.; Herbert, S.; Lehmann, B.; Morse, S.; Stupak, N. A Meta Analysis on Farm-Level Costs and Benefits of GM Crops. *Sustainability* **2011**, *3*, 743–762, doi:10.3390/su3050743.
28. Francescon, S. The impact of GMOs on poor countries: A threat to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals? *Riv. Biol./Biol. Forum* **2006**, *99*, 381–394.
29. Francisco, S.R.; Aragon, C.A.; Norton, G.W. Potential poverty reducing impacts of Bt eggplant adoption in the Philippines. *Philipp. J. Crop Sci.* **2012**, *37*, 30–39.
30. Gabol, W.A.; Ahmed, A.; Bux, H.; Ahmed, K.; Mahar, K.; Laghari, S. Genetically modified organisms (GMOs) in Pakistan. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2012**, *11*, 2807–2813, doi:10.5897/ajb11.001.
31. Gamanagatti, P.B.; Dodamani, M.T.; Gaddi, G.M.; Menasinahal, A.S. Cost and returns in Bt cotton cultivation across different farm sizes in northern transitional zone, Karnataka. *Int. J. Agric. Sci.* **2012**, *8*, 431–435.
32. Glenna, L.L.; Jussaume, R.A., Jr. Social equity and the genetically engineered crops controversy. *Choices Mag. Food Farm Resour. Issues* **2010**, *25*, 1–11.
33. Glover, D. Is Bt cotton a pro-poor technology? A review and critique of the empirical record. *J. Agrar. Change* **2010**, *10*, 482–509, doi:10.1111/j.1471-0366.2010.00283.x.
34. Godara, A.K.; Bas, K.; Bishnoi, O.P.; Mehta, S.K.; Ashok, K. Socio economic impact and problems associated with Bt cotton production in Haryana. *J. Cotton Res. Dev.* **2012**, *26*, 277–280.
35. Gonsalves, C.; Lee, D.R.; Gonsalves, D. The adoption of genetically modified papaya in Hawaii and its implications for developing countries. *J. Dev. Stud.* **2007**, *43*, 177–191, doi:10.1080/00220380601055650.
36. Gouse, M. GM maize as subsistence crop: The South African smallholder experience. *AgBioForum* **2012**, *15*, 163–174.
37. Gouse, M.; Kirsten, J.; Shankar, B.; Thirtle, C. Bt cotton in KwaZulu Natal: Technological triumph but institutional failure. *AgBiotechNet* **2005**, *7*, 1–7.
38. Gruere, G.; Sengupta, D. Bt cotton and farmer suicides in India: An evidence-based assessment. *J. Dev. Stud.* **2011**, *47*, 316–337, doi:10.1080/00220388.2010.492863.
39. Hall, J.; Matos, S.; Langford, C.H. Social exclusion and transgenic technology: The case of brazilian agriculture. *J. Bus. Ethics* **2008**, *77*, 45–63, doi:10.1007/s10551-006-9293-0.
40. Herdt, R.W. Biotechnology in agriculture. *Annu. Rev. Environ. Resour.* **2006**, *31*, 265–295, doi:10.1146/annurev.energy.31.031405.091314.
41. Hofs, J.L.; Fok, M.; Vaissayre, M. Impact of Bt cotton adoption on pesticide use by smallholders: A 2-year survey in Makhathini Flats (South Africa). *Crop Prot.* **2006**, *25*, 984–988, doi:10.1016/j.cropro.2006.01.006.
42. Hoyer Toft, K. GMOs and global justice: Applying global justice theory to the case of genetically modified crops and food. *J. Agric. Environ. Ethics* **2012**, *25*, 223–237, doi:10.1007/s10806-010-9295-x.

43. Huang, J.; Hu, R.; Rozelle, S.; Pray, C. Plant science: Insect-resistant GM rice in farmers' fields: Assessing productivity and health effects in China. *Science* **2005**, *308*, 688–690, doi:10.1126/science.1108972.
44. Huang, J.; Hu, R.; Rozelle, S.; Pray, C. Genetically Modified Rice, Yields, and Pesticides: Assessing Farm-Level Productivity Effects in China. *Econ. Dev. Cult. Change* **2008**, *56*, 241–263.
45. Ivanic, M.; Martin, W. Poverty impacts of improved agricultural productivity: Opportunities for genetically modified crops. *AgBioForum* **2010**, *13*, 308–313.
46. James, C. A global overview of biotech (GM) crops: Adoption, impact and future prospects. *GM Crops* **2010**, *1*, 8–12.
47. Kathage, J.; Qaim, M. Economic impacts and impact dynamics of Bt (*Bacillus thuringiensis*) cotton in India. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2012**, *109*, 11652–11656, doi:10.1073/pnas.1203647109.
48. Kiresur, V.R.; Manjunath, I. Socio-economic impact of Bt cotton-a case study of Karnataka. *Agric. Econ. Res. Rev.* **2011**, *24*, 67–82.
49. Kolady, D.E.; Lesser, W. Potential welfare benefits from the public-private partnerships: A case of genetically engineered eggplant in India. *J. Food Agric. Environ.* **2008**, *6*, 333–340.
50. Krishna, V.V.; Qaim, M. Potential impacts of Bt eggplant on economic surplus and farmers' health in India. *Agric. Econ.* **2008**, *38*, 167–180, doi:10.1111/j.1574-0862.2007.00290.x.
51. Leguizamon, A. Modifying Argentina: GM soy and socio-environmental change. *Geoforum* **2014**, *53*, 149–160, doi:10.1016/j.geoforum.2013.04.001.
52. Lemaux, P.G. Genetically engineered plants and foods: A Scientist's analysis of the issues (Part II). *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* **2009**, *60*, 511–559.
53. Morse, S.; Bennett, R. Impact of Bt cotton on farmer livelihoods in South Africa. *Int. J. Biotechnol.* **2008**, *10*, 224–239, doi:10.1504/ijbt.2008.018355.
54. Morse, S.; Mannion, A.M. Can genetically modified cotton contribute to sustainable development in Africa? *Prog. Dev. Stud.* **2009**, *9*, 225–247, doi:10.1177/146499340800900304.
55. Mutuc, M.; Rejesus, R.M.; Yorobe, J.M., Jr. Which farmers benefit the most from Bt corn adoption? Estimating heterogeneity effects in the Philippines. *Agric. Econ.* **2013**, *44*, 231–239, doi:10.1111/agec.12006.
56. Newell, P.; Mackenzie, R. Whose rules rule? Development and the global governance of biotechnology. *IDS Bull.* **2004**, *35*, 82–91, doi:10.1111/j.1759-5436.2004.tb00111.x.
57. Otero, G.; Pechlaner, G. Food for the few: The biotechnology revolution in Latin America. *Can. J. Dev. Stud.-Rev. Can. D Etudes Du Dev.* **2005**, *26*, 867–887.
58. Ozor, N. Challenges and impacts of agricultural biotechnology on developing societies. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2008**, *7*, 322–330.
59. Parfitt, C. How are genetic enclosures shaping the future of the agrifood sector? *N.Z. Sociol.* **2013**, *28*, 33–58.
60. Pechlaner, G.; Otero, G. The third food regime: Neoliberal globalism and agricultural biotechnology in North America. *Sociol. Rural.* **2008**, *48*, 351–371, doi:10.1111/j.1467-9523.2008.00469.x.
61. Perrin, R.K.; Fulginiti, L.E. Pricing and welfare impacts of new crop traits: The role of IPRs and Coase's conjecture revisited. *AgBioForum* **2008**, *11*, 134–144.
62. Peshin, R.; Dhawan, A.K.; Kamal, V.; Kamaldeep, S. Attributes and socio-economic dynamics of adopting Bt cotton. *Econ. Polit. Wkly.* **2007**, *42*, 73–80.

63. Piesse, J.; Thirtle, C. Genetically modified crops, factor endowments, biased technological change, wages and poverty reduction. *Int. J. Biotechnol.* **2008**, *10*, 184–206, doi:10.1504/ijbt.2008.018354.
64. Pillarisetti, J.R.; Lawrey, R.; Radel, K. GM crops in sub-Saharan Africa: A critical comment on GTAP modelling. *Int. J. Soc. Econ.* **2007**, *34*, 188–196.
65. Pingali, P.L. Green Revolution: Impacts, limits, and the path ahead. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2012**, *109*, 12302–12308, doi:10.1073/pnas.0912953109.
66. Popp, J.; Lakner, Z. Global socio-economic and environmental dimensions of GM maize cultivation. *Food Nutr. Sci.* **2013**, *4*, 8–20, doi:10.4236/fns.2013.46A002.
67. Prasad, R.; Bagde, U.S.; Varma, A. An overview of intellectual property rights in relation to agricultural biotechnology. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2012**, *11*, 13746–13752, doi:10.5897/AJB12.262.
68. Pray, C.E.; Naseem, A. Supplying crop biotechnology to the poor: Opportunities and constraints. *J. Dev. Stud.* **2007**, *43*, 192–217, doi:10.1080/00220380601055676.
69. Punia, R.K.; Malik, J.S.; Sapna, G. Policy issues for biotechnology in agriculture. *Ann. Biol.* **2011**, *27*, 81–86.
70. Purcell, J.P.; Perlak, F.J. Global impact of insect-resistant (Bt) cotton. *AgBioForum* **2004**, *7*, 27–30.
71. Qaim, M. The economics of genetically modified crops. *Annu. Rev. Resour. Econ.* **2009**, *1*, 665–694, doi:10.1146/annurev.resource.050708.144203.
72. Qaim, M. Benefits of genetically modified crops for the poor: Household income, nutrition, and health. *New Biotechnol.* **2010**, *27*, 552–557, doi:10.1016/j.nbt.2010.07.009.
73. Qaim, M.; Kouser, S. Genetically Modified Crops and Food Security. *PLoS ONE* **2013**, *8*, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0064879.
74. Qaim, M.; Matuschke, I. Impacts of genetically modified crops in developing countries: A survey. *Q. J. Int. Agric.* **2005**, *44*, 207–227.
75. Racovita, M.; Obonyo, D.N.; Craig, W.; Ripandelli, D. What are the non-food impacts of GM crop cultivation on farmers' health? *Environ. Evid.* **2014**, *3*, Article 1.
76. Ramasundaram, P.; Vennila, S.; Ingle, R.K. Bt cotton performance and constraints in central India. *Outlook Agric.* **2007**, *36*, 175–180, doi:10.5367/000000007781891487.
77. Raney, T.; Matuschke, I. Current and potential farm-level impacts of genetically modified crops in developing countries. *Front. Econ. Glob.* **2011**, *10*, 55–82.
78. Rao, N.C.; Dev, S.M. Biotechnology and pro-poor agricultural development. *Econ. Polit. Wkly.* **2009**, *44*, 56–64.
79. Regier, G.K.; Dalton, T.J.; Williams, J.R. Impact of genetically modified maize on smallholder risk in South Africa. *AgBioForum* **2012**, *15*, 328–336.
80. Richards, D.G. Contradictions of the “New Green Revolution”: A View from South America's Southern Cone. *Globalizations* **2010**, *7*, 563–576, doi:10.1080/14747731.2010.505025.
81. Ronald, P. Plant genetics, sustainable agriculture and global food security. *Genetics* **2011**, *188*, 11–20, doi:10.1534/genetics.111.128553.
82. Russell, A.W. GMOs and their contexts: A comparison of potential and actual performance of GM crops in a local agricultural setting. *Geoforum* **2008**, *39*, 213–222, doi:10.1016/j.geoforum.2007.04.001.
83. Salazar, E.; Montenegro, G. Genetically modified crops in Chile. *Cienc. Investig. Agrar.* **2009**, *36*, 353–368.

84. Sanglestsawai, S.; Rejesus, R.M.; Yorobe, J.M. Do lower yielding farmers benefit from Bt corn? Evidence from instrumental variable quantile regressions. *Food Policy* **2014**, *44*, 285–296, doi:10.1016/j.foodpol.2013.09.011.
85. Shankar, B.; Bennett, R.; Morse, S. Production risk, pesticide use and GM crop technology in South Africa. *Appl. Econ.* **2008**, *40*, 2489–2500, doi:10.1080/00036840600970161.
86. Speiser, B.; Stolze, M.; Oehen, B.; Gessler, C.; Weibel, F.P.; Bravin, E.; Kilchenmann, A.; Widmer, A.; Charles, R.; Lang, A.; *et al.* Sustainability assessment of GM crops in a Swiss agricultural context. *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* **2013**, *33*, 21–61, doi:10.1007/s13593-012-0088-7.
87. Stone, G.D. Biotechnology and the political ecology of information in India. *Hum. Organ.* **2004**, *63*, 127–140.
88. Stone, G.D. Field *versus* farm in warangal: Bt cotton, higher yields, and larger questions. *World Dev. (Oxf.)* **2011**, *39*, 387–398, doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2010.09.008.
89. Subramanian, A.; Qaim, M. Village-wide Effects of Agricultural Biotechnology: The Case of Bt Cotton in India. *World Dev.* **2009**, *37*, 256–267, doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2008.03.010.
90. Subramanian, A.; Qaim, M. The impact of Bt cotton on poor households in rural India. *J. Dev. Stud.* **2010**, *46*, 295–311, doi:10.1080/00220380903002954.
91. Thirtle, C.; Piesse, J.; Gouse, M. Agricultural technology, productivity and employment: Policies for poverty reduction. *Agrekon* **2005**, *44*, 37–59.
92. Wale, E.Z. On the scale-neutrality of transgenic seeds: Micro-level access, impacts and implications on further research. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2012**, *11*, 8774–8783.
93. Van Zwanenberg, P.; Arza, V. Biotechnology and its configurations: GM cotton production on large and small farms in Argentina. *Technol. Soc.* **2013**, *35*, 105–117, doi:10.1016/j.techsoc.2013.01.007.
94. Vitale, J.; Ouattarra, M.; Vognan, G. Enhancing sustainability of cotton production systems in West Africa: A summary of empirical evidence from Burkina Faso. *Sustainability* **2011**, *3*, 1136–1169, doi:10.3390/su3081136.
95. Vitale, J.D.; Vognan, G.; Ouattarra, M.; Traore, O. The commercial application of GMO crops in Africa: Burkina Faso's decade of experience with Bt cotton. *AgBioForum* **2010**, *13*, 320–332.
96. Yorobe, J.M., Jr.; Smale, M. Impacts of bt maize on smallholder income in the Philippines. *AgBioForum* **2012**, *15*, 152–162.
97. Yuan, D.W.; Bassie, L.; Sabalza, M.; Miralpeix, B.; Dashevskaya, S.; Farre, G.; Rivera, S.M.; Banakar, R.; Bai, C.; Sanahuja, G.; *et al.* The potential impact of plant biotechnology on the Millennium Development Goals. *Plant Cell Rep.* **2011**, *30*, 249–265, doi:10.1007/s00299-010-0987-5.
98. Yusuf, K.M.; Amasiora, V.; Ashanu, E. Recognizing biotechnology as a tool for sustainable development. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2010**, *9*, 8905–8907.
99. Zhao, F.J.; Shewry, P.R. Recent developments in modifying crops and agronomic practice to improve human health. *Food Policy* **2011**, *36*, S94–S101.