

Article

Change in Characteristics of Soil Carbon and Nitrogen during the Succession of *Nitraria Tangutorum* **in an Arid Desert Area**

Xinyou Wang 1,2,3, Quanlin Ma 2,*, Hujia Jin ² , Baoli Fan ² , Duobin Wang ¹ and Huilong Lin 1,*

- ¹ State Key Laboratory of Grassland Agro-Ecosystems, Key Laboratory of Grassland Livestock Industry Innovation, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs, College of Pastoral Agriculture Science and Technology, Lanzhou University, Lanzhou 730020, China; wangxiny@gsrtvu.cn (X.W.); wangdb@lzu.edu.cn (D.W.)
- ² State Key Laboratory of Desertification and Aeolian Sand Disaster Combating, Gansu Desert Control Research Institute, Lanzhou 730070, China; jinhj1984@126.com (H.J.); baoli207@163.com (B.F.)
- ³ College of Science and Technology, Gansu Radio & TV University, Lanzhou 730030, China
- ***** Correspondence: mql925@126.com (Q.M.); linhuilong@lzu.edu.cn (H.L.)

Received: 5 January 2019; Accepted: 19 February 2019; Published: 21 February 2019

Abstract: The shrub *Nitraria tangutorum* is distributed widely in arid desert areas, and plays a critical role in the desert–oasis ecosystem. This study quantified varying characteristics of carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) in the soil at four stages—the initial stage (IS), stable stage (SS), degradation stage (DS), and severe degradation stage (SDS)—in a steppe ecosystem in the desert of northwestern China. The results indicated that *N. tangutorum* experienced both expansion and deterioration as a decline of 50.7% occurred in the available soil water due to agricultural utilization, and the plant community transformed from being shrub-dominated to annual herb-dominated. At soil layer depths between 0–100 cm in the *N. tangutorum* nebkha dune ecosystem, organic C and total N storage was 1195.84 g/m² and 115.01 g/m² during the SDS, respectively, with an increase of 11.13% and 12.59% from the IS. In addition, the storage of C and N in the soil increased during the IS as well as the SS, when most of the C and N were accumulated, and the storage decreased during the DS and SDS, as the *N. tangutorum* communities declined. At soil layer depths between 0–100 cm in the desert steppe ecosystem, the highest storage levels of C and N were 8465.97 g/m^2 and 749.29 g/m^2 during the SS, and the lowest were 1076.12 g/m² and 102.15 g/m² during the IS, respectively. The changes and accumulation of C and N were greater in the deeper (40–100 cm) layer than in the surface layer of soil (0–40 cm). Lastly, changes in soil organic carbon (SOC) as well as in the total nitrogen (TN) were strongly related to the coverage degree, water content in soil, and the ratio of fine soil particles (silt and clay). To sum up, the intensive development of water resources has vastly reduced the ability of *N. tangutorum* vegetation to sequester C and N in the desert of Minqin. Efforts to perform ecological restoration and reverse desertification in the Minqin Desert should focus on preventing the unreasonable exploitation of water resources in order to maintain stable *N. tangutorum* communities.

Keywords: carbon sequestration; nebkhas; soil organic carbon; total nitrogen; vegetation succession; arid desert area; restoration

1. Introduction

Understanding the cycles of carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) in soil in ecosystems is essential for estimating their influence on global climate change [\[1\]](#page-12-0) and determining the ecological strategy (i.e., conservation) of particular land ecosystems [\[2\]](#page-12-1). Deserts and dry shrub lands have great potential to sequester C because of their large extents, and because soil organic carbon (SOC) contents are

relatively low as a result of extensive and prolonged land degradation [\[3](#page-12-2)[,4\]](#page-12-3). In addition, accurate estimates of C change in arid desert areas can inform climate change mitigation efforts on global scales. Nebkhas are the most common landforms in arid desert areas, and their origination and development are considered the indicators for the change in the local climate and environment [\[5\]](#page-12-4). Consequently, research related to nebkhas has increased in recent years.

The presence of nebkhas has been considered a distinctive indicator of land degradation and the intensification of wind erosion [\[6\]](#page-12-5), of a significant decrease in land production, and also of the degradation of an ecological environment [\[7\]](#page-12-6). Thus, most studies focusing on the formation and development of nebkhas are related to vegetation [\[8,](#page-12-7)[9\]](#page-12-8), climate change [\[10\]](#page-12-9), anthropogenic influence [\[6\]](#page-12-5), geological and hydrogeological conditions [\[11–](#page-12-10)[13\]](#page-12-11), wind strength [\[14\]](#page-12-12), and sand source [\[15\]](#page-12-13). However, nutrient cycling in nebkhas, which determines changes in C and N in arid systems through vegetation–soil feedback [\[16\]](#page-12-14), has not been sufficiently studied. The literature review shows that the research focusing on the ecological function of nebkhas has been limited [\[17\]](#page-12-15). Only a few papers have considered sand fixation and the reduction of wind erosion [\[18\]](#page-12-16), the protection of biodiversity [\[11\]](#page-12-10), or the enrichment of soil water and nutrient content in nebkhas [\[19](#page-12-17)[,20\]](#page-12-18).

Shrub-dominated vegetation is the major vegetation type in arid and semi-arid areas, and plays a crucial role in deserts [\[5\]](#page-12-4). Shrubs and nebkha dunes are known to develop interdependently [\[21\]](#page-12-19). In areas that are arid and semi-arid, the character of shrubs does determine the size of nebkha dunes [\[16\]](#page-12-14). Nevertheless, the succession of vegetation in desert ecosystems is mainly influenced by rainfall, groundwater, and soil nutrients. Variation in groundwater depth will directly impact vegetation in the areas under study. Previous studies have revealed that vegetation dies when the level of groundwater drops to a certain degree [\[22\]](#page-12-20). Moreover, the growth of vegetation is also determined by nutrients, especially soil oil matter (SOM) and total nitrogen (TN). In arid and semi-arid regions, "fertile islands" (where organic carbon (OC) and N can be kept) were often formed beneath nebkhas [\[23\]](#page-13-0). Therefore, changes in the storage of C and N are responses to variations in the ecosystem. In addition, the SOC and TN content in the nebkhas can be used to reveal the development of regional vegetation [\[24\]](#page-13-1). However, little is known about how C and N vary at different successional stages of shrub vegetation.

Xerophyte *N. tangutorum* is a dominant shrub in the deserts in China, and is best known for its great tolerance to salt and drought, as well as its highly opportunistic water-use strategy [\[12\]](#page-12-21). It is reported that there are about 152,000 hm² of *N. tangutorum* shrub forest in the Minqin Desert, which accounts for 31.6% of the natural shrub forest in that area [\[25\]](#page-13-2). The shrub forms the primary ecological barrier for the Minqin Oasis [\[25\]](#page-13-2). However, the ecological function depends on the succession of *N. tangutorum* vegetation on the nebkhas [\[26\]](#page-13-3). Thus, studying the succession of *N. tangutorum* vegetation is vital for evaluating the damage of this ecosystem and developing a strategy for its restoration [\[26\]](#page-13-3). Interest in *N. tangutorum* nebkhas is increasing, and numerous studies have described the characteristics of its vegetation and soil nutrient contents [\[27](#page-13-4)[,28\]](#page-13-5), the structure and quantitative characteristics of its communities [\[29\]](#page-13-6), its seed germination effects on water and salinity stresses [\[30\]](#page-13-7), the changing characteristics of its soil seed banks [\[25\]](#page-13-2), the impact of clonal reproduction as well as the allocation of biomass of layering modules [\[31\]](#page-13-8), its diversity in species and the distribution of vegetation [\[32\]](#page-13-9), the relationships of its vegetation and precipitation to soil respiration [\[33\]](#page-13-10) and its root distribution and water uptake dynamics [\[13\]](#page-12-11). However, knowledge on the characteristics of C and N in soil during the succession of *N. tangutorum* communities is still limited, especially in the arid desert regions of northwest China.

In the current study, a space-for-time method was used, and the hypothesis was that the different stages of succession would impact C and N content and the storage of nutrients differently, and that the relationship between C, N, and succession develops in a linear manner in the steppe ecosystem of the desert. The objectives of the study are as follows: (1) to determine the variations in the content of SOC and TN between 0–100 cm depth in soil during the four successional stages of *N. tangutorum* vegetation in an arid desert area; (2) to examine the total as well as average increases of C and N storage during the four successional stages of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas; and (3) to look into the interrelationship between the storage of C and N and plant diversity in the *N. tangutorum* ecosystem.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Study Area

The current study is located in Mingin County $(38°05'-39°06' N, 103°02'-104°02' E, 180-650 m.a.s.l.)$ in the northeast of the Hexi Corridor (Gansu province) [\[17\]](#page-12-15). The region is a typical oasis, with the Badain Jaran Desert in the northwest and the Tengger Desert in the east. This area has a temperate desert climate with a mean annual precipitation of 113.2 mm and a mean annual potential evaporation of 2604.3 mm. Its mean annual temperature is 7.6 ◦C. The prevailing winds are northwest and west–northwest throughout the year, with an average annual speed of 2.5 m·s⁻¹. The total mean annual typical days with sandstorms, strong winds, rising sand, and airborne dirt is 25.0, 26.3, 37.5, and 29.7, respectively (meteorological data calculated from observations at Minqin Desert Control Experiment Station from 1961–2010). Alternating nebkhas, moving dunes, and lowland areas undulating gently characterize the local landscape. The predominant soil is aeolian sandy soil characterized by nutrient depletion and severe wind erosion. The sandy soil is comprised primarily of coarse sand and silt. The surface water resources of Minqin Country have decreased from 573,100,000 m³ in the 1950s to around 100,000,000 m³ at the beginning of this century [\[34\]](#page-13-11). The distance from the surface to the groundwater table has shown an increase from 2.2 m in 1961 to 19.2 m in 2006. The annual increase is 0.50–0.71 m [\[34\]](#page-13-11). The local sand-stabilizing vegetation is comprised of deciduous trees and shrubs. Deciduous trees are mainly *Populus euphratica* and *Elaeagnus angustifolia*, which die from drought. The sand-stabilizing shrubs, including *Nitraria* spp., *Haloxylon ammodendron*, *Caragana korshinskii*, and *Tamarix* spp., tend to deteriorate due to extensive anthropogenic activities, such as the building of the Hongyashan Reservior in the upstream of Shiyang River and the extensive groundwater exploration for human beings [\[6](#page-12-5)[,35\]](#page-13-12). The dominant species on *N. tangutorum* nebkhas at the different successional stages are listed in Table [1](#page-4-0) (after Jin et al. 2013) [\[29\]](#page-13-6). *N. tangutorum* accounts for about 31.2% of all shrubs in Gansu Liangucheng National Nature Reserve, where the total area of shrubs is 23.41×10^{4} hm². This area is considered to be one of the major sources of sandstorms in China and has severe sandstorms, rising sand, and airborne dirt [\[36\]](#page-13-13).

2.2. Experimental Design and Soil Sampling

The present study was carried out in an enclosed area to prevent grazing in Liangucheng National Nature Reserve from May to October 2010. Based on the morphology, vegetation growth status, and soil condition of the nebkhas, four different areas with obvious gradients of vegetative succession were selected as experimental sites. According to the successional stage classification standards, which mainly comprised the extent of shrub vegetation, the morphological characteristics of the nebkhas, and the status of soil crust of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas in this region [\[25\]](#page-13-2), the selected experimental nebkhas at Hongtujing, Qingtuhu, Sanjiaocheng, and Shajingzi villages were divided into four successional stages: an initial stage (IS), stable stage (SS), degraded stage (DS), and severely degraded stage (SDS). Six 30 m \times 30 m plots were chosen in each successional stage at each experimental nebkha, for a total of 24 shrub plots for shrub vegetation surveys. Within each of these plots, five small quadrats $(1 \text{ m} \times 1 \text{ m})$ were chosen, one in the center and four at the corners of the plots, demarcating a total of 120 shrub quadrats for herbaceous plant surveys.

At each shrub plot, the long axis, short axis, height, coverage, and crust status of the nebkha was determined, and the biomass, length of branch, height, shrub vegetation composition, and numerical characteristics of the subsequent *N. tangutorum* community was measured as well (Table [1\)](#page-4-0). In each small quadrat for herbaceous plant surveys, the species composition, coverage, density, and frequency of the herbaceous plants were recorded (Table [1\)](#page-4-0).

In each plot of shrub *N. tangutorum*, three sampling ditches were dug for soil samples collected at six depths (0–5 cm, 5–20 cm, 20–40 cm, 40–60 cm, 60–80 cm, and 80–100 cm), with three replicates. Soil samples were put in sealed plastic bags for transfer to the laboratory. Simultaneously, the bulk density of soil at the six layers in all of the quadrats was measured using a soil corer, a steel cylinder with a volume of 100 cm 3 , with three replicates. On an oven-dry mass basis, after drying samples at 105 $^{\circ}\textrm{C}$ for 24 h, the soil water was determined gravimetrically. Each sample was thoroughly sieved in the laboratory at two mm to get rid of roots and debris. According to McClaran et al. (2008), the changes in the soil characteristics of nebkha are most obvious at five cm [\[37\]](#page-13-14). Part of each sieved sample from the topsoil was air-dried. It was stored at room temperature until the investigation of its particle size distribution as well as chemical attributes could be performed.

2.3. Data Collection and Analysis

Jia et al. (2002) estimated the biomass of the *N. tangutorum* shrub in this study area with biomass allometric functions using data obtained in 2002 [\[35\]](#page-13-12). We used the same biomass allometric functions to estimate the shrub biomass aboveground, belowground, in clay, and inside the dunes in the present study. The four models are as follows [\[35\]](#page-13-12):

$$
Y_{aboveground} = -0.278 + 0.32X_1 - 1.094X_2 + 8.951X_3;
$$

\n
$$
Y_{belowground} = -0.672 + 1.034X_1 - 4.029X_2 + 28.574X_3;
$$

\n
$$
Y_{internal \, dune} = -0.432 + 0.863X_1 - 4.02X_2 + 28.204X_3;
$$

\n
$$
Y_{clay} = -0.24 + 0.171X_1 - 0.01X_2 + 0.369X_3.
$$

where $Y_{\text{aboveground}}$ stands for aboveground biomass, $Y_{\text{belowground}}$ stands for belowground biomass, $Y_{internal \text{ dune}}$ stands for the biomass inside the dunes, Y_{clay} stands for the biomass in the clay; and X_1 , X_2 , and X³ stand for the length, width, and height of the *N. tangutorum*-dominated nebkhas, respectively.

The distribution of soil particle size was determined by the pipette in a cylinder of sedimentation, with Na-hexametha phosphate as the agent for dispersing [\[38\]](#page-13-15). Walkley and Black's K₂Cr₂O₇-H₂SO₄ oxidation method was adopted to measure SOC and active organic carbon (AOC) (Nelson and Sommers, 1982) [\[39\]](#page-13-16). TN was measured using the Kjeldahl procedure (UDK 140 Automatic Steam Distilling Unit, Automatic Titroline96, Italy) (ISSCAS, 1978). The equation showing the amount of OC and TN in each soil layer is summarized below [\[40\]](#page-13-17):

The storage of soil OC or TN = (soil area) \times (soil depth) \times (soil bulk density) \times (average content of OC or TN).

To get the total storages of SOC and TN at 0–100 cm, their storage in each sampling soil layer was summed.

SPSS was used to analyze all the data. One-way ANOVA was adopted for determining the differences among the successional stages. To ensure the assumptions of ANOVA for homogeneity and normality of variance, we applied the log transformation method to transform the data when needed, and followed by multiple comparisons test (Tukey's honestly significant difference test). Significant differences between successional stages were identified by taking $\alpha \leq 0.05$ as significant. The relationship between the corresponding variables was evaluated by using Pearson's correlation coefficients [\[20\]](#page-12-18). Figures were drawn with Origin 9.0 (Origin Lab, Northampton, MA, USA).

Table 1. Main characteristics of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas at different successional stages. IS: initial stage, SS: stable stage, DS: degradation stage, SDS: severe degradation stage.

Values represent means \pm SD (n = 3). Values with the same letters within a row do not show significant difference at P < 0.05.

3. Results

3.1. Changes in Topsoil Texture During Succession

The succession of *N. tangutorum* vegetation had a significant effect on the distribution of particle size and soil water content in nebkha topsoil (0–5 cm) (*P* < 0.05) (Table [2\)](#page-5-0). As *N. tangutorum* vegetative succession progressed, the clay and silt content increased sharply between the IS and the DS, but surprisingly decreased in the SDS. The clay and silt contents were 4.5 and 3.8 times greater during DS than IS, while they were reduced by 35% and 60% during the SDS stage, respectively (Table [2\)](#page-5-0). In general, the contents of clay and silt increased by 259.5% and 94.5% throughout the entire succession process, respectively (Table [2\)](#page-5-0). Compared with IS, the soil water content increased by 2.7% during SS, and was reduced by 17.3% from SS to DS, and by 41.9% from DS to SDS (Table [2\)](#page-5-0). The differences of sand content, bulk density, and soil water content among different successional stages were not significant. The changes in bulk density were not noticeable.

Values represent means \pm SD ($n = 3$). Values with the same letters within a row do not show significant difference at *P* < 0.05.

3.2. Variations in Aboveground and Belowground Biomass during Succession

All the measures of biomass, except for clay biomass, showed similar patterns of fluctuation during *N. tangutorum* succession (Figure [1\)](#page-6-0). Although a sharp decline in biomass was observed during the DS stage, the biomass aboveground and belowground, the biomass inside the dunes, clay biomass, and total biomass increased by 151%, 152%, 146%, 290%, and 127% from the IS to the SDS, respectively (Figure [1\)](#page-6-0). The highest values of the biomass aboveground and belowground, biomass inside the dune, clay biomass, and total biomass were 3.38, 2.86, 2.88, 13.03, and 2.24 times as large as the lowest value during the IS, respectively (Figure [1\)](#page-6-0). The degree of fluctuation was much greater in clay biomass than in the biomass aboveground, belowground, inside the dunes, and the total biomass in both the expanding and receding stages.

3.3. Changes in Soil SOC and TN Content

The OC content at the different layers of soil fluctuated markedly along the gradient of vegetative succession. SOC content at the depths of 0–5 cm, 40–60 cm, 60–80 cm, and 80–100 cm increased sharply from the lowest level in the IS to the peak in the SS, and then decreased gradually during the DS and SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). SOC content in the soil layers from 5–20 cm increased drastically from the IS to SS, and increased continuously to the peak in the DS, and then strikingly decreased to the lowest level in the SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). SOC content in the soil layers from 20–40 cm rapidly reached the peak prior to the SS, and then dropped off steeply to the lowest level during the SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). In general, SOC contents at 0–5 cm, 40–60 cm, 60–80 cm, and 80–100 cm increased by 75%, 6.3%, 39.6%, and 183% throughout succession, respectively. SOC decreased by 27.5% and 10.3% at the 5–20 and 20–40 cm depths, respectively, from the IS to the SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0).

Figure 1. Changes in the biomass aboveground and belowground throughout *N. tangutorum* nebkha succession. IS: initial stage; SS: stable stage; DS: degraded stage; SDS: severely degraded stage. Different lowercase letters indicate a significant variation of biomass difference among different successional stages at the 0.05 level (*P* < 0.05). The SD is indicated with error bars.

Depth (cm)	Stage of Succession						
	IS	SS	DS.	SDS			
SOC(g/kg)							
$0 - 5$	0.76 ± 0.38 ^b	5.00 ± 2.75 ^a	3.96 ± 2.18 ^a	1.33 ± 0.59 b			
$5 - 20$	1.09 ± 0.05 ^{ab}	6.45 ± 4.03 ^a	6.57 ± 0.04 ^a	0.79 ± 0.10 $^{\rm b}$			
$20 - 40$	$0.87 \pm 0.04^{\text{ b}}$	5.99 \pm 3.71 ^a	3.81 ± 0.45 ^a	0.78 ± 0.00 $^{\rm b}$			
$40 - 60$	0.64 ± 0.21 ^b	12.08 ± 4.74 ^a	3.92 ± 2.31 ^{ab}	0.68 ± 0.25 ^b			
$60 - 80$	0.53 ± 0.11 b	6.29 ± 4.04 $^{\rm a}$	4.07 ± 0.76 ^{ab}	0.74 ± 0.25 b			
$80 - 100$	0.29 ± 0.12 ^b	5.98 ± 2.13 ^a	3.17 ± 0.11 b	0.82 ± 0.12 ^b			
Average	0.70 ± 0.29 ^b	5.90 \pm 3.68 ^a	$4.25 + 1.44$ ^a	0.86 ± 0.28 b			
TN(g/kg)							
$0 - 5$	0.07 ± 0.03 ^b	0.28 ± 0.23 ^a	0.38 ± 0.24 ^a	$0.12 \pm 0.06^{\mathrm{b}}$			
$5 - 20$	0.11 ± 0.01 ^{ab}	0.33 ± 0.35 $^{\rm ab}$	$0.62 \pm 0.10^{\text{ a}}$	0.07 ± 0.01 b			
$20 - 40$	$0.08 \pm 0.00^{\mathrm{b}}$	0.30 ± 0.32 ^a	0.34 ± 0.02 ^a	0.08 ± 0.01 b			
$40 - 60$	0.07 ± 0.03 b	0.76 ± 0.27 ^a	$0.32 \pm 0.15^{\text{ b}}$	0.07 ± 0.03 b			
$60 - 80$	0.04 ± 0.01 b	0.79 ± 0.25 ^a	$0.38 \pm 0.05^{\text{ b}}$				
$80 - 100$	0.03 ± 0.01 b	0.69 ± 0.22 $^{\rm a}$	0.30 ± 0.02 ^b	0.07 ± 0.01 b			
Average	0.07 ± 0.03 b	0.52 ± 0.30 ^a	0.39 ± 0.14 $^{\rm a}$	0.08 ± 0.03 b			
C/N							
$0 - 5$	11.20 ± 0.13 ^a	17.97 ± 0.12 ^a	10.39 ± 0.09 a	$10.94 \pm 0.10^{\text{ a}}$			
$5 - 20$	10.32 ± 0.05 ^a	19.48 ± 0.11 ^a	10.64 ± 0.44 $^{\rm a}$	10.72 ± 0.20 ^a			
$20 - 40$	10.31 ± 0.38 ^a	20.10 ± 0.12 ^a	11.17 ± 0.22 ^a	9.77 ± 0.00 $^{\rm a}$			
$40 - 60$	9.77 ± 0.07 ^a	15.86 ± 0.18 $^{\rm a}$	12.21 ± 0.15 ^a	10.20 ± 0.09 ^a			
$60 - 80$	11.72 ± 0.12 ^a	7.93 ± 0.16 $^{\rm a}$	10.66 ± 0.17 $^{\rm a}$	10.26 ± 0.09 ^a			
$80 - 100$	11.24 ± 0.11 ^a	$8.73 \pm 0.10^{\text{ a}}$	10.72 ± 0.06 $^{\rm a}$	10.98 ± 0.15 ^a			
Average	10.79 ± 0.78 $^{\rm a}$	10.81 ± 1.07 ^a	10.97 ± 0.88 ^a	10.49 ± 0.66 ^a			

Table 3. Changes in SOC and TN content (g/kg) at different soil depths during the different successional stages.

Depth (cm)	Stage of Succession						
	IS	SS	DS	SDS			
AOC(g/kg)							
$0 - 5$	0.53 ± 0.26 ^a	2.19 ± 1.96 ^a	2.69 ± 1.57 ^a	0.87 ± 0.37 ^a			
$5 - 20$	0.73 ± 0.07 ^a	2.51 ± 2.83 $^{\rm a}$	$4.44 \pm 0.10^{\text{ a}}$	0.55 ± 0.12 ^a			
$20 - 40$	0.58 ± 0.08 ^a	2.35 ± 2.58 ^a	2.73 ± 0.44 ^a	$0.54 \pm 0.10^{\text{ a}}$			
$40 - 60$	$0.43 \pm 0.16^{\mathrm{b}}$	5.90 ± 2.95 ^a	2.82 ± 1.76 ^{ab}	$0.48 \pm 0.19^{\mathrm{b}}$			
$60 - 80$	$0.38 \pm 0.05^{\mathrm{b}}$	6.54 ± 3.20 ^a	2.93 ± 0.41 ^{ab}	$0.44 + 0.12^{\text{b}}$			
$80 - 100$	0.21 ± 0.10 °	5.23 ± 1.39 ^a	$2.26 \pm 0.04^{\mathrm{b}}$	0.51 ± 0.04 bc			
Average	$0.48 \pm 0.19^{\mathrm{b}}$	4.12 ± 2.56 ^a	$2.98 + 0.98$ ^a	$0.56 \pm 0.18^{\text{ b}}$			

Table 3. *Cont.*

SOC: soil organic carbon; TN: total nitrogen; C/N: carbon/nitrogen ratio; AOC: active organic carbon. Values are means \pm SD ($n = 3$). Values with the same letters within a row do not show significant difference at *P* < 0.05.

The TN content fluctuated enormously throughout vegetative succession, differing between depths of 0–5 cm, 5–40 cm, and 40–100 cm. TN content increased sharply at 0–5 cm from its lowest level during the IS to its peak during the DS, and then it decreased gradually during the SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). Before the DS stage, the soil TN content increased obviously at both 5–20 and 20–40 cm, and reached its peak during the DS. Then, TN declined sharply to its lowest level during the SDS. TN content at 40–60 cm, 60–80 cm, and 80–100 cm increased sharply from the lowest levels during the IS to the peak in the SS, and then decreased gradually during the DS and SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). Overall, the TN content increased by 71.4%, 75.0%, and 133.3% at depths of 0–5 cm, 60–80 cm, and 80–100 cm, respectively; meanwhile, it decreased by 36.4% at 5–20 cm, and was maintained at 20–40 cm and 40–60 cm, from the IS to the SDS (Table [3\)](#page-7-0).

The average C/N values increased slightly in both SS and DS, and slightly declined in the SDS, with only a slight drop (−2.8%) throughout succession (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). The changes in C/N differed greatly among the different soil depths in each successional stage. The C/N values at 0–60 cm were much greater than those at 60–100 cm during the SS.

The AOC in soil increased sharply during the SS, but started to decrease precipitously in both the DS and SDS, resulting in only a slight increase (16.7%) throughout all of succession (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). The changes in AOC also differed greatly among different soil depths at each successional stage. The AOC content at 40–100 cm was much higher than at 0–40 cm during the SS. During the DS, the AOC content at 40–100 cm started to drop, while the content at 0–40 cm was still increasing. The differences of soil AOC content at 0–40 cm were not significant among the different successional stages, while those in 60–100 cm layers and their average in 0–100 cm were significant.

Changes in the content of SOC and TN from the IS to SS were greater than those between the DS and SDS, which were in turn greater than changes between the SS and DS. The average content of SOC and TN at 0–100 cm increased by 22.9% and 14.2%, respectively, from the IS to the SDS.

3.4. Changes in the Storage of C and N in the Soil

The storage of SOC and TN at 0–100 cm in depth fluctuated considerably throughout succession, but overall, there was a slight increase. SOC and TN storage increased by 11.13% and 12.59% from IS to SDS (*P* < 0.05) (Table [4\)](#page-8-0). The storages of SOC and TN were the highest during the SS, with values of 8465.97 gm^{-2} and 749.29 gm^{-2} , respectively. The amounts of C and N were the lowest during the SDS, with values of 1076.12 gm^{-2} and 102.15 gm^{-2} , respectively (Table [4\)](#page-8-0). Compared with the degree of change and the rate of SOC and TN storage in the surface soil layer (0–40 cm), those in the middle soil layer (40–100 cm) were much higher. The total values of SOC and TN storage were 6.87 and 6.33 times greater during the SS than the IS.

	Stages of Succession						
Depths	IS	SS	DS	SDS			
SOC storage $(g/m2)$							
$0 - 5$	60.08 ± 17.31 ^b	224.07 ± 144.01 ^a	255.28 ± 91.63 ^a	102.00 ± 31.84 ^b			
$5 - 20$	254.99 ± 14.31 ^b	793.20 \pm 629.22 ^a	1280.67 ± 8.84 ^a	182.24 ± 9.56 ^b			
$20 - 40$	294.89 ± 18.41 ^b	967.84 ± 750.25 ^a	1142.70 ± 47.97 ^a	242.37 \pm 19.39 ^b			
$40 - 60$	195.66 ± 48.81 ^b	2309.50 ± 948.00 ^a	1207.55 ± 523.14 ^a	196.81 ± 1.32 ^b			
$60 - 80$	173.69 ± 37.82 ^b	2237.37 ± 859.42 ^a	1235.00 ± 78.95 ^{ab}	226.97 ± 19.54 b			
$80 - 100$	96.81 ± 31.80 c	1933.99 \pm 392.43 ^a	$972.60 + 80.89$ ^b	$245.44 + 23.73$ bc			
Total	$1076.12 \pm 168.46^{\text{ b}}$	8465.97 \pm 3723.34 ^a	6093.81 \pm 831.42 ^a	1195.84 ± 105.38 ^b			
TN storage (g/m^2)							
$0 - 5$	5.38 ± 1.31 b	20.41 ± 11.95 ^a	24.52 ± 10.28 ^a	$9.32 \pm 3.19^{\mathrm{b}}$			
$5 - 20$	24.72 ± 2.26 ^b	72.86 ± 55.33 ^a	120.36 ± 13.56 ^a	$17.03 \pm 0.19^{\mathrm{b}}$			
$20 - 40$	$28.57 \pm 0.52^{\circ}$	85.73 ± 64.80 $^{\rm a}$	102.51 ± 0.14 ^a	24.82 ± 1.03 b			
$40 - 60$	$20.06 \pm 6.74^{\mathrm{b}}$	200.67 ± 55.83 ^a	98.78 ± 35.01 ^a	$19.30 \pm 1.02^{\mathrm{b}}$			
$60 - 80$	$14.81 \pm 3.20^{\mathrm{b}}$	192.60 ± 56.83 ^a	116.27 ± 1.75 ^{ab}	22.19 ± 0.24 ^b			
$80 - 100$	8.61 ± 2.87 b	177.01 ± 40.30 ^a	$90.82 \pm 9.04^{\circ}$	$22.36 \pm 1.60^{\mathrm{b}}$			
Total	102.15 ± 16.91 ^b	749.29 \pm 285.03 ^a	553.25 \pm 69.78 ^a	115.01 ± 7.28 ^b			

Table 4. Changes in the storage of SOC and TN in the soil at 0–100 cm during the different successional stages.

Values are means \pm SD ($n = 3$). Values with the same letters within a row do not differ significantly at $P < 0.05$.

3.5. Changes in the Storage of Soil C and N in Relation to Vegetative Succession

To confirm how vegetative succession affects the storage of soil C and N, the distribution of soil particle size, soil texture, and all of the biomass were correlated with the storage of C and N of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas. Through the correlation analysis, it was found that the storage of soil SOC and TN correlated positively significantly $(P < 0.01)$, for which the correlation coefficient was 0.997 (Table [5\)](#page-8-1). The results showed that bulk density and SOC and TN storage correlated negatively and significantly (*P* < 0.01), for which correlation coefficients were −0.695 and −0.688, respectively (Table [5\)](#page-8-1). The correlation analysis also showed there were no significant correlations among the storage of soil SOC and TN with vegetation coverage, aboveground biomass, belowground biomass, clay biomass, total biomass, soil water content, clay content, and silt content (*P* > 0.05) (Table [5\)](#page-8-1). There were significant negative correlations among soil water content, sand content, and slit content ($P < 0.05$), with correlation coefficients of -0.879 and -0.718 , respectively, while no correlations were found with other soil properties and vegetative characteristics (Table [5\)](#page-8-1). Moreover, a correlation analysis showed that there was a significant negative correlation between sand content and TN storage, with a correlation coefficient of −0.997 (*P* < 0.01) (Table [5\)](#page-8-1); while the correlation between the sand content and SOC was not significant (*P* > 0.05), with a correlation coefficient of −0.444 (Table [5\)](#page-8-1).

Table 5. Relationship between the SOC and TN storage, soil properties, and vegetative characteristics during the different successional stages.

Correlation	SSOC	STN	BD	VC	AВ	BВ	CВ	TВ	SWC	CC	SC
STN	$0.997**$										
BD	$-0.695**$	$-0.688**$									
VC	0.753	0.744	-0.635								
AВ	0.708	0.701	-0.860	0.719							
BB	0.628	0.621	-0.816	0.654	$0.994**$						
CB	0.891	0.890	-0.938	0.836	0.946	0.904					
TB	0.623	0.620	-0.822	0.622	$0.990**$	$0.999**$	0.896				
SWC	0.501	0.496	0.300	0.756	0.098	0.003	0.346	-0.038			
CC	0.594	0.604	-0.697	-0.067	0.325	0.299	0.407	0.333	-0.276		
SC	0.543	0.555	$0.692*$	$0.668*$	0.626	$0.647*$	0.442	$0.687*$	$-0.718*$	$0.959**$	
SAC	-0.444	$-0.997**$	$0.979**$	$0.890**$	$0.774**$	$0.828**$	0.395	$0.865**$	$-0.879**$	$0.659*$	$0.710*$

* *P* < 0.05, ** *P* < 0.01. SSOC: storage of soil organic carbon; STN: storage of total nitrogen; BD: bulk density; VC: vegetation coverage; AB: aboveground biomass; BB: belowground biomass; CB: clay biomass; TB: total biomass; SWC: soil water content; CC: clay content; SC: silt content; SAC: sand content.

4. Discussion

In arid desert ecosystems, vegetation restoration results in C and N sequestration [\[19\]](#page-12-17), while vegetation decline or desertification results in C emissions [\[41\]](#page-13-18). The two opposing processes each appeared throughout the successional gradient of vegetation in the present study, and greatly impacted the SOC and TN content and storage in desert regions. Although the C and N pools are comprised of both plants and soil, the soil C pool is considered the main pool, occupying more than 90% of the C in arid and cold ecosystems [\[28\]](#page-13-5). Hence, only C and N in soil were investigated in this study.

4.1. Effects of N. Tangutorum Succession on Soil C and N Content

Variation in vegetation affects the C and N sequestration capacity of the soil where it lives [\[42\]](#page-13-19), and these influences differ among soil depths [\[43\]](#page-13-20). In this study, the ratio (population coverage of *N. tangutorum*/vegetation coverage) increased from 55% (IS) to 92% (SDS) (Table [1\)](#page-4-0), indicating that *N. tangutorum* tended to be more dominant in vegetation community along the successional stages. Hence, more C and TN were sequestered in the soil during SS stages, due to the fast-growing characteristic and strong deep roots system of *N. tangutorum* [\[13\]](#page-12-11). In addition, vegetative succession affects changes in the storage of soil C and N via soil properties and soil biological potential, and biomass related to shrub nebkhas. The variation trends in the average content and storage of the SOC and TN at depths from 0–100 cm were the same as the dynamic changes of the vegetation at each successional stage. This strongly supports related studies where SOC changed with the variety of sand-binding vegetation in desert ecosystems [\[33,](#page-13-10)[44,](#page-14-0)[45\]](#page-14-1). However, different soil depths affect the C and N sequestration at significantly different degrees with the expansion of vegetation. During the IS, the shallow layer had much higher contents of SOC and TN than the deeper layer. In fact, the nutrient contents of the deeper layer (40–100 cm) were quite low, and decreased with the layer gradient, which agrees with other studies [\[44\]](#page-14-0). This can be explained by the higher inputs of organic materials in the shallow soil. Throughout succession, the greatest number of species appeared in this stage. Most of the species were herbaceous (Table [1\)](#page-4-0), with roots distributed at depths between 0–40 cm, which were mostly in the soil layer between 5–20 cm. In addition, the shrub communities were primarily composed of seedlings, with the roots distributed between 0–40 cm [\[46\]](#page-14-2).

Compared with the changes in the SOC, TN content, and AOC content, as well as the storage of SOC and TN in the shallow layer (0–40 cm), those in the middle layer (40–100 cm) were much greater, with the C and N contents sharply increasing in the SS. This mechanism may occur in response to three factors. First, the *N. tangutorum* became the dominant species when most of the annual herbs species vanished due to interspecific competition [\[47\]](#page-14-3), with the more efficient water use by the shrub with its dimorphic rooting habit [\[13\]](#page-12-11). As the shrubs grew, their roots extended to the middle layer (40–100 cm), absorbed more water, and input more C and N into the soil [\[13\]](#page-12-11). Second, the majority of the roots of the *N. tangutorum* community were found at 40–100 cm after the shrubs matured [\[12\]](#page-12-21). Third, the decomposition of herbaceous plant litter occurred more rapidly at the surface than the shrub decomposition of shrub withered root detritus in the middle soil [\[48\]](#page-14-4). Therefore, more C and N were emitted through soil respiration in the surface layer.

The steep drop in the soil C and N contents were mainly attributed to the same rapid decline in the biomass and coverage of the nebkhas vegetation. The recession of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas has greater influence in the middle soil layer than at the surface. This can be explained by the decay of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas, which results in a decreased nutrient input in the soil at the surface and middle layers. Furthermore, the appearance of shallow-rooted annual forbs and grasses compensate for some of the nutrient loss at the surface. The loss of SOC and TN storage began in the DS, mainly because the storage of the total C and N dropped sharply in the middle soil layer (40–100 cm), although that in the surface soil layer (0–40 cm simultaneously) increased significantly. This further demonstrates that soil degradation started earlier in the middle layer than in the surface layer. This can be mainly attributed to the input of C and N from vegetation stopping due to the death of *N. tangutorum* vegetation, which itself was a consequence of the shortage of soil water. That may partially be explained by the smaller C/N value in the middle layer (40–100 cm) (Table [3\)](#page-7-0), which can accelerate microbiological degradation and the mineralization of N.

Due to the excessive irrational allocation of surface water and agricultural development, the groundwater level has fallen sharply in this study area [\[31\]](#page-13-8). In the initial stages of successional *N. tangutorum* communities, the vegetation developed, and hence the soil water was augmented slightly. However, the vegetation deteriorated during the DS, and continued into the SDS due to the significant decrease in available soil water: an overall decline of 50.7% from IS to SDS (Table [2\)](#page-5-0). Water deficits can cause feeder roots to deteriorate at shallow depths [\[49\]](#page-14-5). In this study, the average SOC and TN content began to drop during the DS, and the degree of decline increased further during the SDS, which is concordant with the change in the content of soil water. This affirmed the results of previous studies that attributed the degradation of *N. tangutorum* nebkhas to the soil moisture being lower than the wilting point of plants (0.73% in Minqin-moving dunes) [\[50\]](#page-14-6). Soil moisture is considered to be the most significant abiotic factor affecting the growth and composition of plant communities in arid ecosystems [\[51\]](#page-14-7). This disagrees with Yang and Gao (2000), who reported that the drop in the underground water table does not restrict the growth of *N. tangutorum* in the short term [\[52\]](#page-14-8).

Desert soil in an arid environment typically has a low content of silt and clay [\[53\]](#page-14-9), both of which are rich in OC and N [\[54\]](#page-14-10). The re-vegetation of local shrubs can build a natural system for sand-binding stabilizing mobile dunes, reducing wind erosion and catching fine particles from the atmosphere, which subsequently increases the proportion of fine silt and clay in nebkha topsoils [\[55\]](#page-14-11). In the current study, the contents of SOC and TN sharply increased in the SS with the augments in all the biomass of the *N. tangutorum* shrub nebkhas, while the clay and silt content increased significantly togehter with greater the clay and silt biomass. This also confirmed previous studies where the expansion of vegetation improved C and N sequestration capacity and the physical and microbiological attributes of soil [\[55\]](#page-14-11). Moreover, the establishment of vegetation paves the way for the development of soil crusts in desert ecosystems [\[56\]](#page-14-12), including physical crusts, algal crusts, and moss crusts, which are rich in nutrients [\[57\]](#page-14-13). It has been proved that developing biological soil crusts is effective at enhancing aggregate stability [\[57\]](#page-14-13), enriching the content of organic matter [\[56\]](#page-14-12), improving the physical as well as chemical properties of soil [\[56](#page-14-12)[,57\]](#page-14-13), and also improving soil fertility [\[20\]](#page-12-18). Thus, vegetation and soil crusts play a vital role in restoring desertified land [\[58\]](#page-14-14). In the present study, biological soil crust was found to develop with vegetative community expansion during the IS and SS, with a synchronous increase observed in the soil C and N content. On the contrary, vegetative deterioration accompanied the decrease of soil water content and exacerbated desertification, which accelerated the loss of soil crusts [\[59\]](#page-14-15). With the vegetative recession, the clay and silt contents decreased by 35% and 60% in the SDS, while the sand content increased significantly, and the bulk density increased by 4.4%. Together, these indicated an obvious trend in desertification. The average SOC and TN contents decreased by 85.4% and 84.6% from the SS to the SDS. The destruction of biotic crust can explain the sharp loss of SOC and TN content during the SDS after vegetative degradation. Additionally, vegetation succession impacted the clay biomass more greatly than the biomass inside dunes, the aboveground biomass, and the belowground biomass, which may be another cause. Here, wind erosion aggravated the desertification process [\[59\]](#page-14-15). This is a further verification that the development of biological soil crusts, the succession of vegetation, and the SOC and TN contents are closely related to each other.

4.2. Effects of Annual Herbs on the Content of Soil C and N

It has been reported that China is the major contributor of $CO₂$ to the global temperate and frigid zones; thus, China has great potential to sequester C by reversing desertification processes [\[40\]](#page-13-17). Recent studies have shown that a trend of sandy desertification persists in the desert area near our research sites due to local climate fluctuation and human activities [\[15\]](#page-12-13), posing a great threat to the Minqin Oasis [\[26\]](#page-13-3).

In arid desert steppe ecosystems, the development of shrub nebkhas can enhance the microclimate to support annual herbs [\[60\]](#page-14-16) through positive mutual feedback loops between vegetation and soil, which makes the vegetations for sand-binding more stable and diverse over time [\[50,](#page-14-6)[60\]](#page-14-16). Thus, annual plants functioned importantly in enriching the nutrient in soil in arid ecosystems [\[61\]](#page-14-17). However, opposite patterns were observed in the species and annual herbs of this vegetative community (Table [1\)](#page-4-0). The *N. tangutorum* nebkhas changed from shrub-dominated to majority annual herbs, and tended to unstability in the long run. This agrees with the former study by Chen et al. in the desert–oasis ecosystem near this study area [\[61\]](#page-14-17). However, the C and N storage showed a significant decrease with the encroachment of annual herbs during shrub deterioration (Table [1\)](#page-4-0) after the DS. These results show that the *N. tangutorum* shrub can sequester more C and N than annual herbs, so the community transformation from shrubs to annual herbs leads to major losses of C and N.

4.3. Changes in the Storage of Soil C and N and Implications for Restoration

The C storage at 0–100 cm depth in this study area is 84.66 \pm 3.72 Mg/hm² in the SS when the population coverage of *N. tangutorum* reached its top at 57.14 ± 3.45% (Table [3\)](#page-7-0). This value is much higher than the C storage of the 55-year-old restored system of xeric shrubs plantation (10.2+ ${\rm Mg/hm^2)}$), which is considered a cost-effective method for sequestering $CO₂$ around the Tengger Desert [\[42\]](#page-13-19). This strongly supported the great C sequestration ability of shrub *N. tangutorum*. Moreover, the C storage value in the SS is also significantly higher than the average C storage of major shrublands in China (10.88 \pm 0.77 Mg/hm²) [\[62\]](#page-14-18), as well as the C storage of *Hedysarum scoparium* nebkhas in the middle reaches of the Shiyang River (18.78 Mg/hm²) [\[63\]](#page-14-19). In addition, C storage in the topsoil and sub-topsoil (5.75 g/kg during the SS) was also markedly higher than in the *Haloxylon ammodendron* plantation (1.5 g/kg) and mobile sand dunes (<0.1 g/kg) in the same study area [\[19\]](#page-12-17). This is mainly attributed to the differing carbon sequestration capacities among the different species in the desert ecosystem [\[64\]](#page-14-20). The well-developed deep roots of *N. tangutorum* and that most of the C in the desert ecosystem is sequestrated in soil can explain the greater C storage in the present study [\[42,](#page-13-19)[46\]](#page-14-2).

The results show that the succession of *N. tangutorum* nekbhas in the shrub-dominated desert ecosystems was effective at C and N sequestering in this study. However, the C and N sequestration effect is limited, because there was a huge C and N loss at the end of succession due to desertification. The C and N offset during the succession of *N. tangutorum* nekbhas indicates that the arid desert ecosystem can easily become an emitter if no action is taken to restrain the deterioration of nekbha vegetation.

5. Conclusions

N. tangutorum is the most common desert vegetation in the arid parts of China. Thus, it is an important player in the storage of C and N and the stability of the desert ecosystem. In the Minqin Desert in northwest China, *N. tangutorum* vegetation has experienced both expansion and deterioration, transforming the nekbha vegetation from stable and shrub-dominated to severely degraded and annual herb-dominated, with a slight enrichment of SOC and TN. Therefore, in order to continue to sequester C and N in arid deserts, ecological restoration efforts to reverse desertification should be given priority, including reducing human activities that unreasonably exploit and excessively utilize water resources. Restoration should focus on maintaining the stable stage of vegetative succession, as defined here.

Author Contributions: The paper and experiments were designed by Q.M. and H.L.; Q.M., H.J. and B.F. conducted the investigation; X.W. analyzed the data; X.W. and D.W. performed the data curation; X.W. wrote the paper; and Q.M. and H.L. reviewed the paper.

Funding: This research was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 31660232), the Gansu Province Science and Technology Major Project (18ZD2FA009), the National Special Foundation for Basic Technology and Resources (2017FY100203), the Foundation for Innovative Research Groups of Gansu Province (Grant Number 145RJIA335), and the National Key Technologies Research and development Program of China (SQ2016YFHZ020617).

Acknowledgments: Thanks should go to the anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments for improving this manuscript. We were also grateful to Elizabeth Tokarz at Yale University for improving the langauge in the paper.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- 1. Lal, R. Soil carbon sequestration impacts on global climate change and food security. *Science* **2004**, *304*, 1623–1627. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1097396) [\[PubMed\]](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/15192216)
- 2. Foster, D.; Swanson, F.; Aber, J.; Burke, I.; Brokaw, N.; Tilman, D.; Knapp, A. The importance of landuse legacies to ecology and conservation. *BioScience* **2003**, *53*, 77–88. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1641/0006-3568(2003)053[0077:TIOLUL]2.0.CO;2)
- 3. Lal, R. Potential of desertification control to sequester carbon and mitigate the greenhouse effect. *Clim. Chang.* **2001**, *51*, 35–72. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1017529816140)
- 4. Li, C.F.; Zhang, C.; Luo, G.P.; Chen, X.; Maisupova, B.; Madaminov, A.A.; Han, Q.F.; Djenbaev, B.M. Carbon stock and its responses to climate change in Central Asia. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **2015**, *21*, 1951–1967. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12846) [\[PubMed\]](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/25626071)
- 5. Lang, L.L.; Wang, X.M.; Hasi, E.; Hua, T. Nebkha (coppice dune) formation and significance to environmental change reconstructions in arid and semiarid areas. *J. Geogr. Sci.* **2013**, *23*, 344–358. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11442-013-1014-x)
- 6. Wang, X.; Wang, T.; Dong, Z.; Liu, X.; Qian, G. Nebkha development and its significance to wind erosion and land degradation in semi-arid northern China. *J. Arid Environ.* **2006**, *65*, 129–141. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jaridenv.2005.06.030)
- 7. Tengberg, A.; Chen, D. A comparative analysis of nebkhas in central Tunisia and northern Burkina Faso. *Geomorphology* **1998**, *22*, 181–192. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0169-555X(97)00068-8)
- 8. Yan, Q.L.; Liu, Z.M.; Zhu, J.J.; Luo, Y.M.; Wang, H.M.; Jiang, D.M. Structure, pattern and mechanisms of formation of seed banks in sand dune systems in northeastern Inner Mongolia, China. *Plant Soil* **2005**, *277*, 175–184.
- 9. Nield, J.M.; Baas, A.C.W. The influence of different environmental and climatic conditions on vegetated aeolian dune landscape development and response. *Global Planet. Chang.* **2008**, *64*, 76–92. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2008.10.002)
- 10. Nickling, W.G.; Wolfe, S.A. The morphology and origin of Nabkhas, Region of Mopti, Mali, West Africa. *J. Arid Environ.* **1994**, *28*, 13–30. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-1963(05)80017-5)
- 11. El-Bana, M.I.; Nijs, I.; Kockelbergh, F. Microenvironmental and vegetational heterogeneity induced by phytogenic nebkhas in an arid coastal ecosystem. *Plant Soil* **2002**, *247*, 283–293. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1021548711206)
- 12. Wu, Y.; Zhou, H.; Zheng, X.J.; Li, Y.; Tang, S.T. Seasonal changes in the water use strategies of three co-occurring desert shrubs. *Hydrol. Process.* **2013**, *28*, 6265–6275. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/hyp.10114)
- 13. Xu, S.Q.; Ji, X.B.; Jin, B.W.; Zhang, J.L. Root distribution of three dominant desert shrubs and their water uptake dynamics. *J. Plant Ecol.* **2017**, *10*, 780–790. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/jpe/rtw079)
- 14. Okin, G.S.; Gillette, D.A.; Herrick, J.E. Multi-scale controls on and consequences of aeolian processes in landscape change in arid and semi-arid environments. *J. Arid Environ.* **2006**, *65*, 253–275. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jaridenv.2005.06.029)
- 15. Li, J.C.; Zhao, Y.F.; Liu, H.X.; Su, Z.Z. Sandy desertification cycles in the southwestern Mu Us Desert in China over the past 80 years recorded based on nebkha sediments. *Aeolian Res.* **2016**, *20*, 100–107. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.aeolia.2015.12.003)
- 16. Dougill, A.J.; Thomas, A.D. Nebkha dunes in the Molopo Basin, South Africa and Botswana: Formation controls and their validity as indicators of soil degradation. *J. Arid Environ.* **2002**, *50*, 413–428. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jare.2001.0909)
- 17. Du, J.H.; Yan, P.; Dong, Y.X. Phenological response of *Nitraria tangutorum* to climate change in Minqin County, Gansu Province, northwest China. *Int. J. Biometeorol.* **2010**, *54*, 583–593. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00484-010-0315-3) [\[PubMed\]](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20393859)
- 18. Wang, S.T.; Zou, X.Y.; Chang, C.L.; Cheng, H. Wind-protecting effect of shrub dunes in ecotone of Minqin oasis. *Sci. Geogr. Sin.* **2007**, *27*, 104–108. (In Chinese)
- 19. Fan, B.L.; Zhang, A.P.; Yi, Y.; Ma, Q.L.; Li, X.M.; Zhao, C.M. Long-term effects of xerophytic shrub *Haloxylon ammodendron* plantations on soil properties and vegetation dynamics in northwest China. *PLoS ONE* **2016**, *11*, e0168000. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0168000)
- 20. Ma, Q.L.; Wang, Y.L.; Li, Y.K.; Sun, T.; Milne, E. Carbon storage in a wolfberry plantation chronosequence established on a secondary saline land in an arid irrigated area of Gansu Province, China. *J. Arid Land* **2018**, *10*, 1–15. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s40333-018-0053-7)
- 21. Han, L.; Zhang, Y.Y.; Ma, C.C. Nabkha morphology, development and sand-fixing capability of *Caragana stenophylla* in the Inner Mongolia Plateau. *J. Desert Res.* **2013**, *33*, 1305–1309. (In Chinese)
- 22. Peng, H.J.; Fu, B.J.; Chen, L.D.; Yang, Z.H. Study on features of vegetation succession and its driving force in Gansu desert areas—a case study at Minqin County. *J. Desert Res.* **2004**, *24*, 628–633. (In Chinese)
- 23. Zhang, P.J.; Yang, J.; Zhao, L.Q.; Bao, S.; Song, B.Y. Effect of *Caragana tibetica* nebkhas on sand entrapment and fertile islands in steppe–desert ecotones on the Inner Mongolia Plateau, China. *Plant Soil* **2011**, *347*, 79–90. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11104-011-0813-z)
- 24. Zuo, X.A.; Zhao, X.Y.; Zhao, H.L.; Guo, Y.R.; Zhang, T.H.; Cui, J.Y. Spatial pattern and heterogeneity of soil organic carbon and nitrogen in sand dunes related to vegetation change and geomorphic position in Horqin Sandy Land, Northern China. *Environ. Monit. Assess.* **2010**, *164*, 29–42. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10661-009-0872-2) [\[PubMed\]](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19353287)
- 25. Ma, Q.L.; Lu, Q.; Wei, L.Y.; Jin, H.J. Varying characteristics of soil seed banks during the succession process of *Nitraria tangutorum* vegetation in an arid desert area. *Acta Ecol. Sin.* **2015**, *35*, 2285–2294. (In Chinese)
- 26. Du, J.H.; Yan, P.; E, Y.H. Distribution patterns and characteristics of *Nitraia tangutorun* nebkha at its different evolvement stages in the Minqin Country of Gansu Province. *Chin. J. Ecol.* **2007**, *26*, 1165–1170. (In Chinese)
- 27. Du, J.H.; Yan, P.; Dong, Y.X. Precipitation characteristics and its impact on vegetation restoration in Minqin County, Gansu Province, northwest China. *Int. J. Climatol.* **2011**, *31*, 1153–1165. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/joc.2122)
- 28. Yang, Y.G.; Zhao, C.Y.; Han, M.; Li, Y.K.; Yang, R.H. Temporal patterns of shrub vegetation and variation with precipitation in Gurbantunggut Desert, Central Asia. *Adv. Meteorol.* **2015**, *2*, 1–11. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2015/157245)
- 29. Jin, H.J.; Ma, Q.L.; He, M.Z.; Jia, X.H.; Liu, Y.J.; Zhang, Y.J.; Li, F.H. Analysis on community structure and quantitative characteristics of *Nitraria tangutorum* nebkhas at different succession stage in lower reaches of Shiyang River. *Acta Ecol. Sin.* **2013**, *33*, 2248–2259. (In Chinese)
- 30. Zeng, Y.J.; Wang, Y.R.; Baskin, C.C.; Baskin, J.M. Testing seed germination responses to water and salinity stresses to gain insight on suitable microhabitats for restoration of cold desert shrubs. *J. Arid Environ.* **2014**, *100–101*, 89–92. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jaridenv.2013.10.010)
- 31. Li, Q.; Xu, J.; Li, H.; Wang, S.; Xiu, Y.; Xin, Z.; Jiang, Z.; Wang, L.; Jia, Z. Effects of aspect on clonal reproduction and biomass allocation of layering modules of *Nitraria tangutorum* in nebkha dunes. *PLoS ONE* **2013**, *8*, e79927.
- 32. Zhou, H.; Zhao, W.Z.; Luo, W.C.; Liu, B. Species diversity and vegetation distribution in nebkhas of *Nitraria tangutorum*, in the Desert Steppes of China. *Ecol. Res.* **2015**, *30*, 1–10. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11284-015-1277-z)
- 33. Song, W.M.; Chen, S.P.; Wu, B.; Zhu, Y.J.; Zhou, Y.D.; Li, Y.H.; Cao, Y.L.; Lin, G.H. Vegetation cover and rain timing co-regulate the responses of soil \cos efflux to rain increase in an arid desert ecosystem. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2012**, *49*, 114–123. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.01.028)
- 34. Ma, Q.L.; Wang, J.H.; Zhang, J.G.; Zhan, K.J.; Zhang, D.K.; Chen, F. Ecological protective function of a pioneer species (*Agriophyllum squarrosum*) on shifting sand dunes. *J. Soil Water Conserv.* **2008**, *22*, 140–142. (In Chinese)
- 35. Jia, B.Q.; Cai, T.J.; Gao, Z.H.; Ding, F.; Zhang, G.Z. Biomass forecast models of *Nitraria tangutorum* shrub in sand dune. *J. Arid Land Resour. Environ.* **2002**, *16*, 96–99. (In Chinese)
- 36. Dong, Z.B.; Man, D.Q.; Luo, W.Y.; Qian, G.Q.; Wang, J.H.; Zhao, M.; Liu, S.Z.; Zhu, G.Q.; Zhu, S.J. Horizontal aeolian sediment flux in the Minqin area, a major source of Chinese dust storms. *Geomorphology* **2010**, *116*, 58–66. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geomorph.2009.10.008)
- 37. Mcclaran, M.P.; Moorekucera, J.; Martens, D.A.; Haren, J.V.; Marsh, S.E. Soil carbon and nitrogen in relation to shrub size and death in a semi-arid grassland. *Geoderma* **2008**, *145*, 60–68. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2008.02.006)
- 38. Day, P.R. Particle fractionation and particle-size distribution. In *Methods of Soil Analysis. Agronomy*; Black, C.A., Evans, D.D., White, J.L., Clark, F.E., Eds.; ASA: Madison, WI, USA, 1965; Volume 9, pp. 548–549.
- 39. Nelson, D.W.; Sommers, L.E. Total carbon, organic carbon and organic matter. In *Methods of Soil Analysis, Agronomy, Part 2*, 2nd ed.; Page, A.L., Miller, R.H., Keeney, D.R., Eds.; ASA: Madison, WI, USA, 1982; pp. 539–577.
- 40. Duan, Z.H.; Xiao, H.L.; Dong, Z.B.; He, X.D.; Wang, G. Estimate of total co₂ output from desertified sandy land in China. *Atmos. Environ.* **2001**, *35*, 5915–5921.
- 41. Zhao, H.L.; He, Y.H.; Zhou, R.L.; Su, Y.Z.; Li, Y.Q.; Drake, S. Effects of desertification on soil organic C and N content in sandy farmland and grassland of Inner Mongolia. *Catena* **2009**, *77*, 187–191. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2008.12.007)
- 42. Yang, H.T.; Li, X.R.; Wang, Z.R.; Jia, R.L.; Liu, L.C.; Chen, Y.L.; Wei, Y.P.; Gao, Y.H.; Li, G. Carbon sequestration capacity of shifting sand dune after establishing new vegetation in the Tengger Desert, northern China. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2014**, *478*, 1–11. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.01.063)
- 43. Jobbagy, E.G.; Jackson, R.B. The vertical distribution of soil organic carbon and its relation to climate and vegetation. *Ecol. Appl.* **2000**, *10*, 423–436. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1890/1051-0761(2000)010[0423:TVDOSO]2.0.CO;2)
- 44. Jia, X.H.; Li, X.R.; Li, Y.S. Soil organic carbon and nitrogen dynamics during the re-vegetation process in the arid desert region. *J. Plant Ecol.* **2007**, *31*, 66–74. (In Chinese)
- 45. Li, Y.; Chen, Y.; Wang, X.; Niu, Y.; Lian, J. Improvements in soil carbon and nitrogen capacities after shrub planting to stabilize sand dunes in China's Horqin Sandy Land. *Sustainability* **2017**, *9*, 662. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/su9040662)
- 46. Sun, X.; Yu, Z. A study on root system of *Nitraria tangutorum*. *J. Desert Res.* **1992**, *12*, 50–54. (In Chinese)
- 47. Roberto, A.; Marco, P.; Salvatore, D. Contrasting plant productivity–diversity relationships across latitude: the role of evolutionary history. *Ecology* **2007**, *88*, 1091–1097.
- 48. Christensen, B.T. Physical fractionation of soil and structural and functional complexity in organic matter turnover. *Eur. J. Soil Sci.* **2001**, *52*, 345–353. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2389.2001.00417.x)
- 49. Sperry, J.S.; Hacke, U.G. Desert shrub water relations with respect to soil characteristics and plant functional type. *Funct. Ecol.* **2002**, *16*, 367–378. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2435.2002.00628.x)
- 50. Wang, Y.; Li, C.; Li, A.D.; Yang, Z.H.; Zhang, Q.T.; Liang, X.J.; Qiu, G.Y. The degradation of *Nitraria* dunes and soil water in Minqin oasis. *Acta Ecol. Sin.* **2015**, *35*, 1407–1421. (In Chinese)
- 51. Liu, W.X.; Zhang, Z.; Wan, S.Q. Predominant role of water in regulating soil and microbial respiration and their responses to climate change in a semiarid grassland. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **2009**, *15*, 184–195. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01728.x)
- 52. Yang, Z.H.; Gao, Z.H. Impact of precipitation and underground water level in the edge of oases on growth and decline of *Nitraria tangugtorum* community. *Chin. J. Appl. Ecol.* **2000**, *11*, 923–926. (In Chinese)
- 53. Saxton, K.E.; Rawls, W.J. Soil water characteristic estimates by texture and organic matter for hydrologic solutions. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* **2006**, *70*, 1569–1578. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2005.0117)
- 54. Lowery, B.; Swan, J.; Schumacher, T.; Jones, A. Physical properties of selected soils by erosion class. *J. Soil Water Conserv.* **1995**, *50*, 306–311.
- 55. Dong, X.W.; Zhang, X.K.; Bao, X.L.; Wang, J.K. Spatial distribution of soil nutrients after the establishment of sand-fixing shrubs on sand dune. *Plant Soil Environ.* **2009**, *55*, 288–294. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.17221/13/2009-PSE)
- 56. Zhao, H.L.; Guo, Y.R.; Zhou, R.L.; Drake, S. The effects of plantation development on biological soil crust and topsoil properties in a desert in northern China. *Geoderma* **2011**, *160*, 367–372. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2010.10.005)
- 57. Niu, J.P.; Yang, K.; Tang, Z.J.; Wang, Y.T. Relationships between soil crust development and soil properties in the desert region of North China. *Sustainability* **2017**, *9*, 725. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/su9050725)
- 58. Ma, Q.L.; Fehmi, J.S.; Zhang, D.K.; Fan, B.L.; Chen, F. Changes in wind erosion over a 25-year restoration chronosequence on the south edge of the Tengger Desert, China: implications for preventing desertification. *Environ. Monit. Assess.* **2017**, *189*, 463. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10661-017-6183-0) [\[PubMed\]](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/28836079)
- 59. Du, J.H.; Yan, P.; Zhan, X.L.; You-hao, E. Surface erosion-resistance of *Nitraria tangutorun* nebkhas at different succession stages in Minqin oasis and related affecting factors. *Chin. J. Appl. Ecol.* **2008**, *19*, 763–768. (In Chinese)
- 60. Luo, W.C.; Zhao, W.Z.; Liu, B. Growth stages affect species richness and vegetation patterns of nebkhas in the desert steppes of China. *Catena* **2016**, *137*, 126–133. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2015.09.011)
- 61. Chen, B.M.; Wang, G.X.; Cheng, D.L.; Deng, J.M.; Peng, S.L.; An, F.B. Vegetation change and soil nutrient distribution along an oasis-desert transitional zone in northwestern China. *J. Integr. Plant Biol.* **2007**, *49*, 1537–1547. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1774-7909.2007.00531.x)
- 62. Hu, H.F.; Wang, Z.H.; Liu, G.H.; Fu, B.J. Vegetation carbon storage of major shrublands in China. *Chin. J. Plant Ecol.* **2006**, *30*, 539–544. (In Chinese)
- 63. Ma, Q.L.; Xu, L.H.; Chen, F.; Zhang, D.K.; Wang, X.Y.; Jin, H.J.; Liu, Y.J. Restoration changes in organic carbon stocks of the vegetation and soil ecosystems in the reversion process of desertification in arid areas. *Adv. Geosci.* **2018**, *8*, 48–59. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.12677/AG.2018.81006)
- 64. Liu, W.H.; Zhu, J.J.; Jia, Q.Q.; Zheng, X.; Li, J.S.; Lou, X.D.; Hu, L.L. Carbon sequestration effects of shrublands in Three-North Shelterbelt Forest region, China. *Chin. Geogr. Sci.* **2014**, *24*, 444–453. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11769-014-0698-x)

© 2019 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/\)](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.).